Charity Today 2017

- The charity sector’s place in the national fabric and daily life
- Recent and future challenges faced by charities

p1: Overview

p2-5: The big issues facing charities

p6-12: Snapshot of charity

#charitytoday
Charity Today 2017: overview

Charity is a broad term - as broad as ‘business’ or ‘government’.

Charities come in a vast array of different shapes and sizes – everything from local groups led by volunteers to complex and sophisticated international development or research organisations.

What ties charities together is the common thread of public benefit and social good. In their different ways they play an essential role in our everyday lives and in our communities.

In the past year, 83% of people in the UK have used a charitable service and 8 out of 10 people agree that charities play a vital role in their local community.

Charities provide many essential services, from education to health and social care to community centres and sports clubs. They care for our heritage, bring people together in their communities and work across the globe. They provide the public with ways to directly support the causes people care about through donations and volunteering. But more than that, the collective state of ‘charity’ in the UK says something important about our nation as a whole.

There are over 160,000 registered charities in England and Wales alone and many, many more informal charitable groups.

The overall income of the charitable sector is around £43.8bn, 2.9bn hours are given by volunteers and over £9.6bn was donated by the British public in 2015.

The £29bn of income that today comes from public donations or trade in charity shops, nursery places or cafés would, for example, be enough to buy nine Royal Navy aircraft carriers.

The charity sector spends £1,578 every second or £136.4m a day on charitable activities.

Charities are evolving and adapting to meet new demands; they are responding to the needs of beneficiaries and to the changing external environment. There are many challenges ahead to ensure that charities remain effective, sustainable, relevant to new generations and importantly that they provide value and are valued by the public.

At the same time charities are facing increasing scrutiny from the public, the media, and from the government. The collapse of Kids Company and stories of inappropriate fundraising by some charities has undoubtedly shaken public confidence.

This report provides an overview of the charity sector, how it operates, how it’s changing and what’s going on with charity today.

1 CAF (2016) Charity Street II: A report into how we use charities in the UK
2 Ibid
3 Using Charity Commission data the Charities Aid Foundation identifies the total amount spent on charitable activities as £49.8bn a year. See https://www.charitycommission.gov.uk. It is to be noted that CAF’s analysis only looks at charities in England and Wales with an income of over £500k per year – accounting for only around 10,000 of the 164,000 registered charities. This subset was chosen as it is only charities over this threshold which are required to report their finances at the level of detail required to carry out this analysis.
The big issues facing charities

The past 18 months have been tumultuous for the charity sector. From the collapse of Kids Company to reports of unacceptable fundraising practice, every element of charity activity and management has come under scrutiny. New legislation has been produced, and a new fundraising regulator has been established.

It is quite right that charities, their regulation, governance and ethics, should be both transparent and of the highest order. It is also fair to say that the effect of the past 18 months has been an erosion of public confidence, a confidence which underpins the very survival and effectiveness of charities.

The size and scope of the UK voluntary sector

The charity and social sector is a vital part of the fabric of a strong society in the UK. It comprises more than 160,000 registered charities in England and Wales alone and countless social enterprises and community groups. Voluntary sector organisations are incredibly diverse and represent a range of aims and activities. The sector employs some 827,000 people—more than two and a half times the number employed by Tesco, and over half the number working for the NHS.

The emergence of £100m+ income charities

In 2013/14 there was a notable increase in the number of organisations with an annual income over £100m. It rose from 33 organisations to 40. They make up only 0.02% of all charities by number but have 18.4% of the total income of the sector. This group has a large impact on income trends for the whole sector.

Smaller charities are more likely to be financially volatile

Just as the sector is diverse in its range and types of organisations, that diversity extends to the stability of organisations’ incomes. Smaller charities do not fare as well as large. The most recent available figures show the three smaller income bands experienced decreases in overall income and were less financially secure, mirroring the findings of recent research on behalf of Lloyds Bank Foundation for England and Wales.

Organisations with incomes between £25,000 and £1m are more likely to experience volatility and instability in their income. The latest data shows that around one-third of charities with an annual income of less than £1m report that they have no reserves at all, making them especially vulnerable to external shocks. This lack of reserves does not represent bad management but rather unprecedented financial constraint at a time of increased demand for services.

---

4 NCVO (2016) Civil Society Almanac 2016 Available at: https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/
5 NCVO (2016) Civil Society Almanac 2016 Available at: https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/
6 NCVO (2016) Civil Society Almanac Available at: https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/finance-overview/
7 Ibid Available at: https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/assets-and-reserves#Reserves
**Contribution to the economy**

According to our analysis, more than £1,500 is spent every second on charitable services in England and Wales. Every day, charities spend £136.4m – equivalent to £1,578 per second – improving lives and supporting communities.

Volunteers are worth £16.5bn to the sector if the 2.9bn hours given are valued at the National Living Wage (£7.20 as of April 2016).

**People's goodwill and generosity remains the lifeblood of the sector**

Britain is the most generous country in Europe and consistently one of the most generous countries on Earth. The CAF World Giving Index consistently ranks Britain as among the top most 10 generous countries. For many, donating to charity gives them the ability to help a cause they believe in, and make a positive contribution to their community. For every £1 invested in fundraising activity, charities on average receive £4 in donations.

During 2014/15, 14.2 million people in the UK reported having volunteered at least once a month: this equates to 27% of the population. Equally, income from individuals remains the largest source of income for the sector – in 2013/14 it amounted to £19.4bn, a figure that continues to grow. 2013/14 saw a rise in the income of the sector as a whole, to £43.8bn, mainly driven by the increase in income from individuals. Income from government also rose slightly, to £15bn, although this is still lower than its peak in 2008/09 and the longer-term trend is downwards. Levels of government grants to the sector – £2.8bn – are less than half the level they were 10 years ago but have not declined further. Most of the recent rise in government grant and contracts is accounted for by the larger charities.

**The external environment for charities is going to be tough in the coming years**

It has been a challenging period for UK charities. There are questions about charities’ role in society – questions for example about their tradition of campaigning in support of their beneficiaries. This is not a UK-only issue: around the world, what tends to get called ‘civil society’ is facing more sceptical governments. It’s much less evident that these questions translate into falling support, whether from volunteers or donations. Indeed, evidence suggests that despite these questions over charities, public donations to the causes they support remain as strong as ever.

There are some very specific issues facing the charity sector in coming years. These include:

---

8 Using Charity Commission data the Charities Aid Foundation identifies the total amount spent on charitable activities as £49.8bn a year. See [here](https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/volunteer-overview/). It is to be noted that CAF’s analysis only looks at charities in England and Wales with an income of over £500k per year – accounting for only around 10,000 of the 164,000 registered charities. This subset was chosen as it is only charities over this threshold which are required to report their finances at the level of detail required to carry out this analysis.

9 Ibid Available at: [https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/income-from-government/](https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/income-from-government/)

10 Ibid Available at: [https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/income-from-government/](https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/income-from-government/)
The public services challenge

An ageing, more atomised population is increasing demand for public services. Voluntary organisations and volunteering are part of the solution – particularly around reducing demand for services and early intervention. Charities also provide many traditional services, under contract with local or national government. The private sector is much bigger and in some cases competes directly against charities. Reforms to how the government works with charities, how they buy and fund services from charities, are all ongoing issues.

The digital challenge

Charities are no different to any other sector in that they are both challenged and encouraged by the rise of digital and the way in which it has empowered users, in this case to do good outside of traditional structures. Just as any sector/institution might ask itself how it can be relevant to the millennial generation, so too might charities. The sector has to face up to whether or not charities and volunteering as we currently know them are relevant to a generation that has been brought up in a digital age and look to different forms and mechanisms for social action (such as online platforms, petition sites, crowdfunding). Charities face the challenge of operating in a digital world where people buy, sell, talk and meet online. They have to be efficient, while recognising that a charity, however large, is not the same as a supermarket or a bank.

The sustainability challenge

Paradoxically, at a time when the need and demand for voluntary organisations and volunteering is increasing, the sector is under unrelenting pressure to increase service delivery without a proportionate increase in financing. Reductions in income from statutory grants and contracts are likely to continue with a disproportionate effect on smaller and medium sized charities. Furthermore, charities must comply with tighter regulations and scrutiny and must make sure they act in line with the high expectations the public has of them. This will mean in some cases making changes to the way they approach fundraising and donor engagement, with a possible short-term negative impact on income.

In order to weather financial shocks and create additional income streams, more charities are diversifying and introducing trading arms or providing goods and services to fund their charitable activities.

The distinctiveness challenge

The boundaries between the public, private and voluntary sectors will continue to blur over the next five years: parts of the state may be turned into charities and mutuals; social enterprises will blend business and social purposes, while businesses try and present themselves as socially useful; individuals might not need charities to achieve their goals as they go digital. In such a world the sector will need not only to prove why charities and volunteering are different and distinctive, but will also need to be clear that its values accord with those who do want to ‘do good’ and that its practices fit with its values.
The sector is moving away from traditional models

The sector is diversifying. Organisations legally constituted as charities are no longer the sole purveyors of public benefit. Instead, there are a variety of different forms of organisation each working in their own way to improve the lives of our most vulnerable. As well as these new organisations, existing charities are moving away from a purely donation-driven model and towards trading or providing goods and services.

This type of ‘earned income’ has become a more important part of charitable income than donations since 2003/4, and currently makes up 55% of the sector’s income.11

The rise of social enterprise

Social enterprise is a broad term, used to define organisations which occupy the territory between charities and traditional private businesses. There are a variety of definitions of this group, but on the whole they are organisations who carry out commercial activities, while also delivering a public benefit (all without being registered as a charity). Some forms of social enterprise, such as Community Interest Companies, have formal restrictions on the use of their funds, while others are far closer to traditional companies. Various groups have drawn different lines between social enterprises and traditional businesses.

Estimating the scope of social enterprise is a difficult task. The best data comes from the government’s Small Business Survey in 2012.12 This found that there were 70,000 social enterprises across the country, with a GVA (‘gross value added’ – that is, contribution to the national economy) of £18.5bn. These were defined as self-identifying social enterprises which received more than a quarter of their income from trading, and paid out less than half of their profits to owners or shareholders. Since 2012, this number has undoubtedly increased, with 35% of social enterprises surveyed in 2015 being less than three years old.13

Buy social

Gone are the days when the only way individuals could support charities was by putting a pound in the donations tin. Gone even are the days when volunteering was the only alternative to donating. As charities and social enterprises begin to focus more on commercial activity, it is increasingly common for individuals to support good causes through their purchasing. In 2013/14, charities received around £10bn from the public through their trading activities14 – in addition to the income of the tens of thousands of social enterprises across the country.

11 NCVO (2016) Civil Society Almanac 2016 Available at: https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/income-sources/
14 Own analysis of NCVO (2016) Civil Society Almanac Data available at https://data.ncvo.org.uk/a/almanac16/finance-overview/
**Snapshot of charity**

In September 2014, there were 164,097 registered charities in England and Wales (according to Charity Commission data). That roughly works out to over 280 charities in each parliamentary constituency. In addition to this there are tens of thousands of charities who have an income below £5,000 a year, and thus do not have to register.

- Over 14.2 million people in the UK volunteer at least once a month.\(^{15}\)
- 80% of people in the UK think charities play an essential role in their local community.\(^{16}\)
- In the last year 83% of UK households used a charity service.\(^{17}\)
- 84% of people in the UK think charities are best placed to speak on behalf of disadvantaged people.\(^{18}\)

**Health**

Health charities had an income of just under £4bn in 2013/14 – the latest year for which figures are available.

They spent £4.4bn, the equivalent of £12m a day on medical research, hospital and rehabilitation services\(^{19}\). In addition to this:

- Almost one in five people (18%) have received medical care from a charity during their life.\(^{20}\)
- For cancer alone, Macmillan Cancer Support’s telephone support line answered almost 144,000 calls and helped over 62,000 people by providing them with expert advice in a year.\(^{21}\)
- Research shows that a cancer diagnosis leaves 83% of patients financially worse off.\(^{22}\) Macmillan Cancer Support provided free advice to help almost 21,000 people secure £50m in benefits they were entitled to.\(^{21}\)
- The British Heart Foundation funds around £100m of new research into cardiovascular disease every year.\(^{23}\)
- Approximately 85% of people with Parkinson’s have access to a dedicated Parkinson’s nurse service.\(^{24}\)
- In 2015, Parkinson’s UK committed an additional £2.5m in new scientific grants towards finding better treatments faster.\(^{25}\) In 2015, the Parkinson’s UK helpline team answered more than 28,400 queries.\(^{26}\)

\(^{15}\) Based on data from the NCVO Almanac for 2013/2014  
\(^{16}\) CAF (2016) *Charity Street II: A report into how we use charities in the UK*  
\(^{17}\) Ibid  
\(^{18}\) Ibid  
\(^{19}\) Original analysis by CAF from Charity Commission data  
\(^{20}\) Online poll of 2,070 GB adults aged 18+ conducted by Populus for CAF and IPPR between 23\(^{rd}\) and 24\(^{th}\) July 2014  
\(^{22}\) Macmillan Cancer Support, “Cancer patients can’t afford Christmas”  
\(^{24}\) Parkinson’s UK, “Our Impact in 2015”,  
\(^{25}\) Ibid  
\(^{26}\) Ibid
Sport

In 2014 sports charities had an income of just over £1bn and spent a similar amount. That’s the equivalent of £2.8m a day. And much of this is driven by thousands of people who provide their expertise, enthusiasm and guidance for free.

What does £1bn look like?
- 59 community sports centres.
- 1,100 football pitches.
- 6,896 multi-use games areas.

There are 6,824 community and amateur sports clubs registered with HMRC.

Children and young people

The most popular cause for people to support is children and young people.

- Charitable playgroups and nurseries had an income of £88.7m in 2014 and spent £83.8m, the equivalent of £230,000 per day. Many charitable playgroups are small charities run by community groups providing vital local services and support to families.
- Parent teacher associations had an income of £32.4m in 2014 and spent £32.5m, the equivalent of £89,000 per day. There is overwhelming evidence that parent participation in education helps children do better in school and PTAs are one of the most common enablers of such participation.

Arts and culture

Arts and culture charities had an income of £4.2bn in 2014 and spent £3.9bn, the equivalent of £10.8m a day.

This annual spending could:
- Buy Picasso’s masterpiece, Femme assise, 90 times over.
- Pay the £260m cost of the new Tate Modern extension 15 times over.

Suicide and self-harm prevention

- Suicide is the biggest killer of men under 50 and the biggest killer of young people aged 20-34. Every 90 minutes someone in the UK dies by suicide making suicide a bigger killer than traffic accidents.

---

27 Original analysis by CAF, based on data available
29 http://www.cascinfo.co.uk/
32 Daily Mail, “Picasso masterpiece becomes the most-expensive painting sold in the UK for six years” http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-3654437/SOLD-Picasso-masterpiece-expensive-painting-sold-UK-six-years.html
There are more than 20,000 Samaritans volunteers who help run 201 branches across the UK and ROI.\textsuperscript{36}

- Samaritans answers a call for help every six seconds.\textsuperscript{37}
- Samaritans responded to over 5.4m calls for help in 2015 across phone calls, texts, emails and in person. \textsuperscript{38}
- It costs the Samaritans £4.26 to answer a call for help.\textsuperscript{39}

\textbf{Animals}

Animal protection and welfare charities had an income of just over £1.1bn in 2014, and spent around the same amount, the equivalent of £3m a day.

Some figures from individual charities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charity</th>
<th>Numbers of those reached in most recent year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blue Cross</td>
<td>119,866 (pets, current owners and future owners)\textsuperscript{40}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSPCA</td>
<td>153,605 animals treated 118,994 animals rescued and collected\textsuperscript{41}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cats Protection</td>
<td>500 cats a day helped 44,000 cats rehomed/reunited with owners 159,000 cats neutered\textsuperscript{42}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{36} Samaritans, “Samaritans say a big thank you to their volunteers”, http://www.samaritans.org/branches/samaritans-pendle-burnley-craven-and-rossendale/samaritans-say-big-thankyou-their
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid
\textsuperscript{39} Samaritans, “Get real this Christmas”, http://www.samaritans.org/news/get-real-christmas-says-samaritans
\textsuperscript{41} RSPCA Trustees’ report and accounts 2015, https://view.pagetiger.com/RSPCATrusteesReportandAccounts2015/issue1
International aid and development

Some figures from individual charities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charity</th>
<th>No of people who accessed support in most recent year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Save the Children International</td>
<td>62 million&lt;sup&gt;43&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxfam</td>
<td>11.6 million&lt;sup&gt;44&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Relief Worldwide</td>
<td>8.3 million&lt;sup&gt;45&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WaterAid</td>
<td>2 million reached with water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.1 million reached with sanitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8.2 million reached with hygiene&lt;sup&gt;46&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In 2015/16 Oxfam directly helped 11.6m people in 51 countries through humanitarian and development work, including helping:

- 5.4 million people have clean water to drink.
- 1.7 million people receive food, cash or vouchers, enabling them to survive in a crisis.
- 1.5 million people have better sanitation, greatly reducing the spread of disease.
- 4.3 million people reached by health-promotion activities.<sup>47</sup>

Almost 23,000 volunteers help run Oxfam’s 650 shops throughout the UK. Last year Oxfam shops raised over £17.8m to help fight poverty around the world.<sup>48</sup>

Donations from the public to Oxfam in 2015/16 increased by £7m to £114.5m, its second-highest ever level, superseded only by the Asian Tsunami in 2004. This was largely thanks to generous responses to major humanitarian disasters, from the Nepal earthquake to ongoing conflicts in South Sudan, Syria and Yemen.<sup>49</sup>

Hospices

On average, adult hospices receive only 34% of their funding from the government, with the rest coming from fundraising. However, the level of statutory funding varies widely across the country.

---

<sup>43</sup> Save the Children Annual Review 2015, https://i.stci.uk/sites/default/files/libraries/Save%20the%20Children%20Annual%20Review%202015.pdf  
<sup>46</sup> WaterAid Annual Reports 2015/2016, http://www.wateraid.org/uk/who-we-are/annual-reports  
<sup>49</sup> Ibid.
Charitable hospices collectively need to raise £1.9m per day – amounting to more than £9,000 per hospice each day. More than 125,000 people give their time to volunteer in hospices each year. \(^{50}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charity</th>
<th>No. people who accessed support in most recent year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hospice UK</td>
<td>The hospice care sector supports approximately 200,000 people with terminal and life-limiting conditions in the UK each year. (^{51})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Older people**

Some figures from individual charities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charity</th>
<th>No. people who accessed support in most recent year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age UK</td>
<td>5.9 million (^{52})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Age</td>
<td>1 million (^{53})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Royal Voluntary Service</td>
<td>100,000 (^{54})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Housing**

Housing charities, which include housing associations, had an income of £4.6bn in 2014, and spent £4.1bn, the equivalent of £11.3m a day.

**Advice services**

Some figures from individual charities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Charity</th>
<th>No. people who accessed support in most recent year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Advice</td>
<td>2,500,000 (^{55})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope</td>
<td>250,000 (^{56})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shelter</td>
<td>5,000,000 (^{57})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{50}\) Hospice Accounts 2016, https://www.hospiceuk.org/what-we-offer/publications?cat=12b04112-4ccd-608d-ad24-ff0000fd3330
### Faith

There are 50,000 faith-based charities in England and Wales, with a combined income of £16.3bn, according to [analysis published by think tank NPC](http://www.thinknpc.org/publications/faith-matters/).

### Search and rescue

- The Royal National Lifeboat Institution (RNLI) provides a 24/7 emergency search and rescue service over 100 nautical miles of the coasts of the UK and Ireland.
- It has 237 lifeboat stations, with 349 lifeboats.
- RNLI lifeguards patrol over 220 beaches around the UK and Channel Islands.
- Seven flood rescue teams across the UK and Ireland.
- In 2015, RNLI’s lifesavers helped over 26,000 people.
- 95% of the RNLI’s people are volunteers.
- In 2015, it cost about £168m to run the RNLI: that’s £460,000 a day.
- 95% of the RNLI’s total income comes from donations.
- The RNLI is the first UK charity to move to ‘opt-in’ communications – from 1 January 2017, it will only contact supporters if they’ve given their express permission.

### Additionally

- 8,300 charity retail shops will generate over £820,000 a day in profit to directly fund charitable purposes.
- The National Trust spends an average of £293,424 conserving heritage sites each day and [22.5m people visited sites in 2015/2016](http://www.nationaltrust.org.uk/press-releases/2015-16annisual-review).
- Mountain Rescue attended 1,051 incidents in 2014.
- Every year, 400,000 people learn how to save a life through St Johns Ambulance training programmes, including hundreds of thousands of young people. This also raises awareness of first aid and directly educates the public. The Chokeables campaign has so far saved 53 babies from choking.

---

58 Number of people who accessed support in 2015, Money Advice Trust, [www.moneyadvicetrust.org/impact2016](http://www.moneyadvicetrust.org/impact2016)
61 The RNLI Lifeboat Rescue Statistics, [http://www.1nb.uk/html/the_rnli.html](http://www.1nb.uk/html/the_rnli.html)
Public engagement

- The majority of UK households have used a charity service in the last 12 months (83%), rising from 79% in 2014.\(^{64}\)
- Young people (60%) and women (54%) are most likely to have personally used a charity service in the previous month.\(^{65}\)
- Usage of charities is incredibly diverse: 88% had purchased an item from a charity shop, 73% had visited a charity-run gallery, museum, garden or stately house, right through to 6% who had bought or rented a property through a charitable housing association.\(^{66}\)
- Although 80% think that charities in their local community play an essential role, a staggering 23% are unaware that the charity services that they use were run by charities.\(^{67}\)

About the partner organisations

ACEVO
ACEVO is the charity and social leaders’ network. We provide support, development and an inspiring, collective campaigning voice for our members across the UK. Our members are the leaders of small, community based groups, ambitious medium-sized organisations, and well known, well-loved national and international not-for-profits. Our leaders drive positive change in their organisations and in their communities and we give them a platform to do even more.

www.acevo.org.uk

Charities Aid Foundation
CAF is one of Europe’s largest charitable foundations and is the leading provider of financial services to the charitable sector. CAF provides simple and straightforward day-to-day banking and fundraising services for charities, freeing them up to focus on the critical work of making a difference.

www.cafonline.org

CharityComms
CharityComms is the membership network for communications professionals working in UK charities. We’re here to help raise the standards of communications across the sector, to fly the flag for communications as a vital strategic function at the heart of charities, and to connect communications professionals through sharing best practice.

http://www.charitycomms.org.uk

Institute of Fundraising
The Institute of Fundraising is the professional membership body for UK fundraising. We support fundraisers through leadership and representation; best practice and compliance; education and networking; and we champion and promote fundraising as a career choice.

http://www.institute-of-fundraising.org.uk

\(^{63}\) CAF (2016) Charity Street II: A report into how we use charities in the UK
\(^{64}\) CAF (2016) Charity Street II: A report into how we use charities in the UK
\(^{65}\) Ibid
\(^{66}\) Ibid
\(^{67}\) Ibid